The Honorable Joseph R. Biden President of the United States The White House 1600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, D.C. 20500

The Honorable Merrick B. Garland Attorney General of the United States U.S. Department of Justice 950 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington DC 20530

December 19, 2024

Re: Abolition of DOJ McKittrick Policy

Dear President Biden and Attorney General Garland:

The undersigned organizations seek the abolition of the U.S. Department of Justice's "McKittrick Policy." This internal policy directs DOJ prosecutors not to request, and to object to, the use of general intent jury instructions in jury trials enforcing violations of the Endangered Species Act¹ ("ESA"), which then requires the prosecution to prove that a defendant knew the identity of the ESA protected species when they took it. This creates a higher threshold for conviction under the ESA than Congress intended, and effectively discourages prosecutors from bringing criminal cases forward. This Policy also discourages enforcement in the field by U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service ("USFWS") agents. Moreover, the recovery of multiple species listed as "endangered" or "threatened" under the ESA, including whooping cranes, Mexican gray wolves, California condors, Florida panthers, red wolves, gray wolves, wolverines, and grizzly bears, many of which have been intentionally reintroduced by the government, is severely threatened by this heightened evidentiary standard that has been controlling prosecutions since 1999.

Congress passed the Endangered Species Preservation Act of 1966, the first piece of comprehensive endangered species legislation, to protect and restore endangered species. The Endangered Species Conservation Act of 1969 improved upon the 1966 Act, providing better protection to species habitats and considered species in danger of worldwide extinction. Finally, Congress passed the Endangered Species Act of 1973 ("ESA") to provide even greater protections for endangered and threatened species. The United States Supreme Court has held that-

(T)he plain intent of Congress in enacting this statute...was to halt and reverse the trend toward species extinction, whatever the cost. .... Agencies in particular are directed by §§ 2 (c) and 3 (2) of the Act to "use...all methods and procedures which are necessary" to preserve endangered species.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 16 USC § 1531 et seq.,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Tennessee Valley Auth. v. Hill, 437 U.S. 153, 184, 98 S. Ct. 2279, 57 L. Ed. 2d 117 (1978)

Unfortunately, the protection and recovery of multiple species listed under the ESA have been severely undermined and hampered by DOJ's McKittrick Policy. There are numerous critical examples.

The whooping crane (*Grus americana*) is a large white bird which has a seven ft. wingspread and at five ft. tall is the tallest bird in North America. Once found throughout North America, the last wild flock of whooping cranes had been reduced to fewer than 20 birds by the 1940s, due to habitat loss and hunting. By 1950, Louisiana's historical population of whooping cranes had been wiped out and reduced to one bird which was transferred to another State. As a result of these situations, the whooping crane became one of the species which prompted the passage of the predecessor laws to the current ESA in the 1960's mentioned above and is currently listed as endangered under the ESA. At present, the *entire* North American population of this bird, wild and captive, is approximately just 834 birds.

In 2011, Louisiana Department of Wildlife and Fisheries (LDWF) commenced a project to reintroduce whooping cranes into southwest Louisiana where they once thrived. Reintroduction costs LDWF and its partners \$85,000 per whooping crane currently. While Louisiana's non-migratory flock continues to slowly increase, there are only 81 in the current Louisiana flock. Sadly, Louisiana's efforts to discourage the indiscriminate and illegal shooting of these whooping cranes through education, billboards, and press releases has been largely ineffectual, as shootings continue because enforcement is nearly impossible due to the McKittrick Policy. Louisiana's death toll of whooping cranes is now the highest in the United States.

The Mexican gray wolf (*Canis lupus baileyi*) was reintroduced into the American Southwest in 1998 and has begun a halting process of recovery. The primary cause of mortality at present is illegal shootings. Of 40 confirmed gunshot deaths of Mexican gray wolves between 2008 and 2023, only 17 resulted in the identification of suspects, 13 were referred for prosecution, and U.S. assistant attorneys declined prosecution in 11 of those cases. At least five of those dismissed cases explicitly cited to the McKittrick policy.

Gray wolves (*Canis lupus*) and red wolves elsewhere in the United States have encountered similar problems. A gray wolf that dispersed from Yellowstone National Park to the north rim of the Grand Canyon in 2014 was shot by a hunter in Utah claiming to mistake the wolf for a coyote. That hunter was not prosecuted due to the McKittrick Policy.

Native to the Southeast, the red wolf (*Canis rufus*) is the world's most endangered canid and is uniquely "All-American" as its entire historical range is confined within what is now the United States. Once abundant across the Southeast, red wolves now live in just five counties in eastern North Carolina near the Alligator River National Wildlife Refuge. The leading cause of death in red wolves is poaching, and at least some of this is (legitimately or not) attributed to mistaken identity.

In 1987, a novel captive breeding and reintroduction program for red wolves began which also provided an important model for subsequent reintroduction programs to restore gray wolves, Mexican gray wolves, California condors and black-footed ferrets to the wild. Captive-bred red wolves were released into the wild every year between 1987 and 2014, which helped boost the wild population to nearly 150 animals. Tragically, this progress came to a screeching halt and the population crashed due to a number of factors including a dramatic spike in illegal poaching with enforcement hampered by the McKittrick Policy. By 2020, only seven red wolves were left in the wild.

Lastly, further out in the West, grizzly bears (*Ursus arctos horribilis*) have also been affected by DOJ's McKittrick Policy. In at least 18 grizzly killings between 2015 and 2022, federal prosecutors declined to press charges due to claims of mistaken identity.

Abolition of the McKittrick Policy should improve the plight of all of these species. Indeed, the prospect of increased fines and jail time have been shown to be significant deterrents to future rule-breaking,<sup>3</sup> and the fear associated with these potential negative consequences creates an important deterrent by itself.<sup>4</sup> By eliminating these deterrents, the McKittrick Policy effectively enables if not encourages the killing of ESA-listed species and allows those who intentionally kill listed species to evade legal consequences. The existence of this Policy, and the ability to escape culpability for violations of the ESA, is well-known to those who have an interest in killing listed species, who do not include educated and responsible hunters and sportsmen.

Particularly concerning is the fact that the McKittrick Policy is not law, and actually exists in contravention of law, specifically the letter and spirit of the ESA. The Policy was not created pursuant to statute, rule-making, or judicial decision. Instead, its origin lies in a case of the same name, *United States v. McKittrick*, where the perpetrator had shot, skinned and beheaded an endangered gray wolf and was convicted under general intent jury charges. His conviction was affirmed at which time the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeal held that McKittrick "need not have known he was shooting a wolf to 'knowingly violate' the regulations protecting the experimental population."

For reasons that remain unclear,<sup>7</sup> when McKittrick sought an appeal before the U.S. Supreme Court, the Solicitor General voluntarily announced in the Government's Brief that DOJ would no longer use general intent jury instructions because he was unsure what "knowingly" meant under the ESA.<sup>8</sup> An internal DOJ Memo issued shortly thereafter requiring specific intent jury charges in all ESA enforcement actions. The so-called "McKittrick Policy" was thereby established.

As its origin story reflects, the McKittrick Policy directly contravenes the plain wording of the ESA requiring proof of only *general* intent as the ESA's "knowingly" standard was interpreted by the Ninth Circuit in *McKittrick*, which remains good law. Yet, under the McKittrick Policy bearing the same name, DOJ ironically still requires all federal prosecutors to request jury instructions with a heightened *mens rea* or *specific* intent requirement in all prosecutions under the ESA. Because of the McKittrick Policy, perpetrators need only claim that they thought they were shooting a different species, such as a great egret instead of a whooping crane, a coyote instead of a Mexican wolf, a vulture instead of a California condor, or, a black bear instead of a grizzly bear, to escape the more severe penalties of the ESA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Furlong, W.J. (1991), *The deterrent effect of regulatory enforcement in the fishery*. Land Economics 67(1):116–129

<sup>4</sup> May, P.J. (2005). Regulation and compliance motivations: Examining different approaches. Public Administration Review 65(1):31–44

<sup>5 142</sup> F.3d 1170, 1177 (9th Cir. 1998)

<sup>6</sup> *Id.* (emphasis added)

<sup>7</sup> Newcomer, Ed; Palladini, Marie; and Jones, Leah -Article-"The Endangered Species Act v. The United States Department Of Justice: How The Department Of Justice Derailed Criminal Prosecutions Under The Endangered Species Act," 17 Animal L. 251, 267 (2011) 8 Id.

In sum, this requirement of specific intent in jury instructions under the DOJ's McKittrick Policy creates a nearly impossible burden of proof in ESA prosecutions, deterring federal prosecutors from pursuing maximum penalties under the ESA and encouraging them to pursue lesser penalties under other laws, if applicable, with their lesser burdens of proof. Meanwhile, relief in the courts remains elusive as the latest court direct challenge to the McKittrick Policy was initially successful, but failed on appeal due to technical standing issues. <sup>10</sup>

All hope is not lost, however. Because the McKittrick Policy is not law, and because DOJ created and implemented the McKittrick Policy simply by issuing an internal DOJ Memorandum, the McKittrick Policy can therefore be revoked with another internal DOJ Memorandum, or, with an Executive Order.

Accordingly, the undersigned organizations hereby call upon the U.S. Attorney General to revoke the policy known as the McKittrick Policy. Alternatively, we seek the support of President Biden to issue an Executive Order to eliminate the DOJ's McKittrick Policy in its entirety if the DOJ is unable to revoke the policy through internal memorandum.

Respectfully,

[signatories]

Chris Allieri
NYC Plover Project
c/o JBRPC Office
11404 Beach Channel Drive
Rockaway Park, NY 11694
chris@nycploverproject.org

Sally Paez, Staff Attorney New Mexico Wild PO Box 25464 Albuquerque, NM 87125 sally@nmwild.org

Donald A. Molde, M.D., Co-founder **Nevada Wildlife Alliance** P.O. Box 4049 Incline Village, NV 89450 info@nvwildlifealliance.org

Tara Thornton, Director of Institutional Engagement **Endangered Species Coalition** 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> WildEarth Guardians v. United States DOJ, 283 F. Supp. 3d 783, 789 (D. Ariz. 2017)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> WildEarth Guardians v. United States DOJ, 752 F. App.'x 421, 423 (9th Cir. 2018)

PO Box 65195 Washington, DC 20035 tthornton@endangered.org

Renee Seacor, Carnivore Conservation Director **Project Coyote**P.O. Box 5007
Larkspur, CA 94977
rseacor@projectcoyote.org

Erin Hunt, Managing Director **Lobos of the Southwest** P.O. Box 243 Salt Lake City, UT 84110 <a href="mailto:erin@mexicanwolves.org">erin@mexicanwolves.org</a>

Claire Musser, Executive Director **Grand Canyon Wolf Recovery Project** P.O. Box 233 Flagstaff, AZ 86002 <u>claire@gcwolfrecovery.org</u>

Kristin Combs, Executive Director **Wyoming Wildlife Advocates** PO Box 1772 Wilson, WY 83014 kristin@wyowild.org

Chris Smith, Wildlife Program Director WildEarth Guardians
301 N Guadalupe, Suite 201
Santa Fe, NM 87501
csmith@wildearthguardians.org

Timothy Coleman, Executive Director **Kettle Range Conservation Group** 40 Horseshoe Lane Republic, WA 99166 tcoleman@kettlerange.org

Adrian Treves, Professor Carnivore Coexistence Lab Madison, WI 53705 adriantreves@gmail.com

Brooks Fahy **Predator Defense** PO Box 5446 Eugene, OR 97405

#### Brooks@predatordefense.org

Michelle Lute, PhD Wildlife for All PO Box BB UT 84110 michelle@wildlifeforall.us

Jason Kahn, Board President **The Rewilding Institute** 170 Iduna Lane Amherst, MA 01002 jasonkahn9@gmail.com

Kirk Robinson, Executive Director Western Wildlife Conservancy 1021 Downington Ave. Salt Lake City, UT 84105 lynx@xmission.com

Lisa Robertson, President/Co-Founder Wyoming Untrapped
PO Box 9004
Jackson, WY 83002
lisa@wyominguntrapped.org

Katie Cleary

Peace 4 Animals

PO Box 643

Woodland Hills, CA 91365

Peace4AnimalsRescue@gmail.com

Carol Ann Fugagli Executive Director Upper Gila Watershed Alliance P.O. Box 1536 Silver City, NM 88062 director@ugwa.org

Chris Bachman

Yaak Valley Forest Council
1426 Seventeen Mile Rd.
Troy, MT 59935

cbachman@yaakvalley.org

KC York, President/Founder Trap Free Montana PO Box 335 Hamilton, MT 59840 info@trapfreemt.org

Wally Sykes, Co-Founder **Northeast Oregon Ecosystems** Box 733 Joseph, OR 97846 <u>wally sykes2000@yahoo.com</u>

Regan Downey, Director of Education Wolf Conservation Center PO Box 421 South Salem, NY 10590 regan@nywolf.org

Reana Wilson, Campaign Member The #RelistWolves Campaign reana@tuskstrategies.com

Annie Chester, Policy Director **American Bird Conservancy** 4301 Connecticut Ave NW #451 Washington, DC 20008 <u>achester@abcbirds.org</u>

Jennifer O. Coulson, President Orleans Audubon Society 64340 Fogg Lane Pearl River, LA 70452 Orleans Audubon@aol.com

Kim Wheeler, Executive Director Red Wolf Coalition
212 Main Street
Columbia, NC 27925
kwheeler@redwolves.com

Garrick Dutcher, Research and Program Director Living with Wolves
PO Box 896
Sun Valley, ID 83353
gdutcher@livingwithwolves.org

Elizabeth Novogratz

Species Unite
321 Manhattan Avenue #2

Brooklyn, NY 11211

elizabeth@speciesunite.com

Shawn Karns, Director of Investigations and Training Wildlife Investigators Training Alliance

1629 K Street NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20006 <a href="mailto:shawn.karns777@gmail.com">shawn.karns777@gmail.com</a>

Collette Adkins
Center for Biological Diversity
PO Box 595
Circle Pines, MN 55014-0595
cadkins@biologicaldiversity.org

John M. Glowa, Sr., President **The Maine Wolf Coalition, Inc.** 30 Meadow Wood Drive South China, ME 04358 jglowa@roadrunner.com

Shelby L Bobosky, Esq. **Texas Humane Legislation Network**PO BOX 685283

Austin, TX 78768-5283

shelby@thln.org

Thomas Wheeler, Executive Director

Environmental Protection Information Center- EPIC
145 G. St.

Arcata, CA 95521

tom@wildcalifornia.org

Jonathan B. Ratner, Director **Sage Steppe Wild** 31 Old Tie Hack Rd Cora, WY 82925 Jonathan@Wild-Sage.org

Karol Miller, President **The 06 Legacy**950 W University Dr
Rochester, MI 48307
Karolmiller832@gmail.com

Kimberly Baker, Executive Director Klamath Forest Alliance
2274 Eastern Ave.
Arcata, CA 95521
klam\_watch@yahoo.com

Bill Given, President/Director **The Wild Source** 801 14th St.

Golden, CO 80401 bgiven@thewildsource.com

David Jenkins, President

Conservatives for Responsible Stewardship
P.O. Box 613

Oakton, VA 22124

djenkins@conservativestewards.org

Jonathan Way, Ph.D. **Eastern Coyote**/Coywolf Research
89 Ebenezer Road
Osterville, MA 02655
jw9802@yahoo.com

Wildlife Advocacy Coordinator **Green Mountain Animal Defenders** P.O. Box 4577 Burlington, VT 05406 wildlifea@gmad.info

Mia Glover
Inland Ocean Coalition
4669 7th Street
Boulder, CO 80304
mia@inlandoceancoalition.org

Kayla Mohammed, Federal Policy Advocate
Friends of the Earth
1101 15th St NW, Floor 11
Washington, DC 20005
kmohammed@foe.org

Marc Cooke, President
Wolves of the Rockies
Rome Lane
Stevensville, MT 59870
marc@wolvesoftherockies.org

Joseph S. Butera, President & Co-Founder Northeast Ecological Recovery Society 83-37 267 Street Floral Park, NY 11004 joebutera 123@gmail.com

Roger E. McManus, Member of the Board of Directors Friends of the Sonoran Desert 300 N. Indian House Road Tucson, AZ 85711

#### redwardmcmanus@gmail.com

Jennifer Gooden, President **Biophilia Foundation**1201 Parson Island Road;
Chester, MD 21619
jennifer@biophiliafoundation.org

Danielle Moser, Wildlife Program Manager **Oregon Wild** 5825 N Greeley Ave Portland, OR 97217 dm@oregonwild.org

Carla Mena, Director of Policy & Legislative Affairs Los Padres ForestWatch
PO Box 831
Santa Barbara, CA 93102
carla@lpfw.org

Jane Pargiter, Executive Director **EcoFlight**307 L AABC
Aspen, CO 81611
jane@ecoflight.org

Vicki Deisner, Executive Director **Ohio Animal Advocates** P.O. Box 1161 Columbus, OH 43216 vicki.deisner@gmail.com

Deanna Meyer, Executive Director **Prairie Protection**PO Box 497
Sedalia, CO 80135
prairieprotectioncolorado@gmail.com

Lesley Sampson, Founding Executive Director Coyote Watch Canada
P.O Box 507
St. Davids, ON Canada
info@coyotewatchcanada.com

Carol Monaco, Founder
Wild Once More Rehabilitation
15200 Clinton St
Brighton, CO 80602
Cmonaco@marketwiseinsights.com

Anne Dal Vera, Northern Front Range Broadband Great Old Broads for Wilderness
2913 Ringneck Drive
Fort Collins, CO 80526
dalveran@hotmail.com

Christopher Amato, Conservation Director and Counsel **Protect the Adirondacks! Inc.**105 Oven Mountain Road Johnsburg, NY 12843 conservationdirector@protectadks.org

Scott Edwards, General Counsel
Center for a Humane Economy
PO Box 30845
Bethesda, MD 20824
sedwards@animalwellnessaction.org

Dr. Kari Gunderson, Wilderness Ed. Specialist **Montana Wilderness Education School** P.O. Box 1008 Condon, MT 59826 cnd2543@blackfoot.net

Nancy Warren

National Wolfwatcher Coalition
PO Box 161281
Duluth, MN 55816-1281
nancy@wolfwatcher.org

George Nickas, Executive Director Wilderness Watch
PO Box 9175
Missoula, MT 59807
gnickas@wildernesswatch.org

Christine Gertschen

Conservation Connection Foundation
P.O. Box 2167
Sun Valley, ID 83353
cgertschen@cox.net

Scott Edwards, General Counsel **Animal Wellness Action** 611 Pennsylvania Ave. SE #136 Washington, DC 20003 <u>sedwards@animalwellnessaction.org</u>

Melissa Amarello, Executive Director **Advocates for Snake Preservation** PO Box 2752 Silver City, NM 88062 mel@snakepreservation.org

Jessica Karjala, Executive Director Footloose Montana
PO Box 8884
jessica.karjala@footloosemontana.org

Tim Whitehouse **Public Employees for Environmental Responsibility**962 Wayne Ave, Suite 610
Silver Spring, MD 20910

twhitehouse@peer.org

Johanna Hamburger, Director and Senior Attorney Terrestrial Wildlife Program Animal Welfare Institute 900 Pennsylvania Ave SE Washington, DC 20003 johanna@awionline.org

Sandy Bahr Sierra Club - Grand Canyon Chapter 514 W Roosevelt St Phoenix, AZ 85003 sandy.bahr@sierraclub.org

Madhu Anderson

Wyoming Wildlife Protection Group
Rock Springs, WY

Wyomingwildlifeprotectiongroup@gmail.com

Beatrice M. Friedlander, Board President Attorneys for Animals
49651 Shenandoah Cir
Canton, MI 48187
beefriedlander@yahoo.com

Allison Ludtke, Legislative Affairs Manager Animal Legal Defense Fund 525 East Cotati Avenue Cotati, CA 94931 Aludtke@aldf.org

Jane Patterson, President

Baton Rouge Audubon Society

PO Box 67016 Baton Rouge, LA 70896 president@braudubon.org

Theo Daniels, Assistant Director of Policy and Programs Rachel Carson Council
1701 Rhode Island Ave NW
Washington, DC 20036
theo@rachelcarsoncouncil.org

Jennifer Best, Wildlife Law Program Director Friends of Animals
7500 E. Arapahoe Rd.
Centennial, CO 80112
jennifer@friendsofanimals.org

Nancy Hilding, President **Prairie Hills Audubon Society**P.O. Box 788

Black Hawk, SD 57718

<a href="mailto:nhilshat@rapidnet.com">nhilshat@rapidnet.com</a>

KJ Burrola, Executive Director Voices of the Land 306 12th Ave Greeley, CO 80631 stories.vol@gmail.com

Brenna Galdenzi **Protect Our Wildlife** PO BOX 3024 Stowe, VT 05672 info@protectourwildlifevt.org

Allyson Dallmann, Executive Assistant Great Lakes Wildlife Alliance 117 Ardmore Dr.
Madison, WI 53713
allysonrdallmann@outlook.com

Sara Husby, Executive Director Great Old Broads for Wilderness 555 Rivergate Lane Suite B1-110 Durango, CO 81301 sara@greatoldbroads.org

Alison Gallensky, Conservation Geographer Leadership Team **Rocky Mountain Wild** 1536 Wynkoop St, Suite 900

Denver, CO 80202 <u>alison@rockymountainwild.org</u>

Betsy Klein

Plan B to Save Wolves
2370 W SR 89A Suite 11-303
Sedona, AZ 86336
b@planb.foundation

Kate Scott, Co-Founder

Madrean Archipelago Wildlife Center
141 Page Lane
Elgin, AZ 85611
madreanwildlife@gmail.com

Erik Molvar **Western Watersheds Project** PO Box 1770 Hailey, ID 83333 emolvar@westernwatersheds.org